



#### COMP 1002

#### Intro to Logic for Computer Scientists

Lecture 12







## Admin stuff

- Assignment 2 posted. Due Feb 5.
  - Sources are posted in LaTeX, EazyTeX, Markdown and HTML



# Proofs

- What is a theorem?
  Lemma, claim, etc
- What is a proof?
  - Where do we start?
  - Where do we stop?
  - What steps do we take?
  - How much detail is needed?





# Theories and theorems

- **Theory:** axioms + everything derived from them using rules of inference
  - Euclidean geometry, set theory, theory of reals, theory of integers, Boolean algebra...
  - In verification: theory of arrays.
- **Theorem:** a true statement in a theory
  - Proved from axioms (usually, from already proven theorems)



Pythagorean theorem

- A statement can be a theorem in one theory and false in another!
  - Between any two numbers there is another number.
    - A theorem for real numbers. False for integers!

#### Axioms example: Euclid's postulates



- Through 2 points a line segment can be drawn
  - A line segment can be extended to a straight line indefinitely
- III. Given a line segment, a circle can be drawn with it as a radius and one endpoint as a centre
- IV. All right angles are congruent
- V. Parallel postulate

#### Some axioms for propositional logic

- For any formulas A, B, C:
  - $A \lor \neg A \equiv True$
  - $True \lor A \equiv True.$
  - False  $\lor A \equiv A$ .
  - $\operatorname{AV} A \equiv A \wedge A \equiv A$

 $A \land \neg A \equiv False$ 

 $True \land A \equiv A$ 

- $False \land A \equiv False$
- Also, like in arithmetic (with ∨ as +, ∧ as \*)
  - $-A \lor B \equiv B \lor A$  and  $(A \lor B) \lor C \equiv A \lor (B \lor C)$
  - Same holds for  $\wedge$ .
  - Also,  $(A \lor B) \land C \equiv (A \land C) \lor (B \land C)$
- And unlike arithmetic

 $-(A \land B) \lor C \equiv (A \lor C) \land (B \lor C)$ 

## Counterexamples



- To disprove a statement, enough to give a counterexample: a scenario where it is false
  - To disprove that  $A \rightarrow B \equiv B \rightarrow A$ 
    - Take A = true, B = false,
    - Then  $A \rightarrow B$  is false, but  $B \rightarrow A$  is true.

### Counterexamples



- To disprove that if  $\forall x \exists y P(x, y)$ , then  $\exists y \forall x P(x, y)$ ,
  - Set the domain of x and y to be {0,1}
  - Set P(0,0) and P(1,1) to true, and P(0,1), P(1,0) to false.
    - So P(x,y) is x = y. This is called an **interpretation** of P(x,y)
  - Then  $\forall x \exists y P(x, y)$  is true, but  $\exists y \forall x P(x, y)$  is false.
    - Because  $(P(0,0) \lor P(0,1)) \land (P(1,0) \lor P(1,1))$  is true,
    - But  $(P(0,0) \land P(1,0)) \lor (P(0,1) \land P(1,1))$  is false.
  - So the counterexample in this case consists of *domains* for x and y (they don't have to be equal), and an *interpretation* of the predicate P(x, y) over these domains.

## Constructive proofs



- To prove a statement of the form ∃x, sometimes can just find that x
  - $\exists x \in \mathbb{N} Even(x) \land Prime(x)$ 
    - Set x=2.
    - Even(x) holds.
    - Prime(x) holds.
    - Therefore,  $Even(x) \wedge Prime(x)$  holds.
    - Done.
  - This proof is **constructive**, because we constructed an x which makes the formula  $Even(x) \wedge Prime(x)$  true.

# Proof



- To prove that something of the form  $\forall x F(x)$ :
  - Make sure it holds in every scenario (method of exhaustion)
    - For all possible values of A and B,  $\neg B \rightarrow \neg A$  is equivalent to  $A \rightarrow B$ , by checking the truth table.
  - But there can be too many scenarios!
    - For any integer, there is a larger integer which is a prime.
    - For any two reals, there is a real between them.
  - Instead, use axioms and rules of inference to derive it.

 $\neg B \to \neg A \equiv \neg \neg B \lor \neg A \equiv B \lor \neg A \equiv \neg A \lor B \equiv A \to B$ 

- So  $(\neg B \rightarrow \neg A) \leftrightarrow (A \rightarrow B)$  is a tautology.
- And, therefore,  $\forall A, B \in \{ True, False \}, \neg B \rightarrow \neg A \equiv A \rightarrow B$

### Puzzle 11



• Let  $S = \{x \in \mathbb{N} \mid x \text{ is } even \land x \text{ is } odd\}$ 

• Prove or disprove:

#### $\forall x \in S$ , x does not divide $x^2$



